

Deadline of Submission of Comments: 15-May-23

Document Number: ANSI/ASB Std 133

Document Title: Standard for Age Estimation in Forensic Anthropology

#	Section	Type of Comment (E-Editorial, T-Technical)	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Editor or Working Group Review
1	1	T	<p>In our last round of comments, we made this comment, which we haven't received an answer to as far as we're aware:" In adjudicating previous comments--particularly those suggesting this is a "Best Practices" document, rather than a standard--the Committee repeatedly refers back to the language in the scope that "specific methods and techniques are not included in the standard." The absence of specificity is precisely why this reads as a "Best Practices" document. The ultimate focus of a standard is not on the mere presence or absence of standards but on the scientific supportability of the methods governed by those standards. Absent information about what is scientifically supportable, the standard has little meaning because there are in fact no specific criteria that would show the examiner or someone reviewing their work whether the particular examination was performed reliably."</p>	<p>Expand the disclaimer in the Scope section to make clear that the absence of specificity does not mean that any unspecified method or technique will be acceptable under this standard. Suggested language: "This standard lists the procedures and protocols that a forensic science service provider should have for age estimation in forensic anthropology but does not fully specify the content that those procedures and protocols must have. This standard does not substitute for standards that will more specifically set forth minimum requirements or best practices for the procedures and protocols mentioned here."</p>	<p>Reject: The scope was not a redline portion of the document.</p> <p>For additional clarification: The scope is appropriately written for this document. The requirements section adequately reflects what this document contains and does not contain. The intent of this standard is to provide minimum requirements for age estimation in the forensic anthropology practice, and as such does not make recommendations for specific protocols or methods. A Best Practice Recommendation for age estimation is being drafted to provide more specific guidance.</p>